PARK CITY MUNICIPAL CORPORATION HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS April 1, 2014



AGENDA

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER AT 5:00PM ROLL CALL ADOPTION OF MINUTES OF March 4, 2015 – Continued to May 6, 2015 PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS – Items not scheduled on the regular agenda STAFF/BOARD COMMUNICATIONS AND DISCLOSURES CONTINUATIONS		
Historic District Grant Program Policy Discussion Public hearing and continued to May 6, 2015	GI-12-00190 Planner Grahn	
440 Main Street – Historic Grant Application for Restoration of a Historic Structure <i>Public hearing and continued to May 6</i> , 2015	PL-15-02707 Planner Grahn	
264 Ontario Avenue – Historic Grant Application for Restoration of a Historic Structure <i>Public hearing and continued to May 6, 2015</i>	PL-14-02418 Planner Whetstone	
REGULAR AGENDA – Discussion, public hearing, and possible action as outlined below		
332 Woodside Avenue – Determination of Significance of Historic House Public hearing and possible action	PL-15-02642 Planner	

1259 Norfolk Avenue – Determination of Significance of Historic House Public hearing and possible action PL-15-02642 3 Planner Grahn PL-15-02645 19 Planner Turpen

ADJOURN

A majority of Board members may meet socially after the meeting. If so, the location will be announced by the Chair person. City business will not be conducted.

Pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, individuals needing special accommodations during the meeting should notify the Park City Planning Department at (435) 615-5060 24 hours prior to the meeting.





Planning Department

Author:Anya Grahn, Historic Preservation PlannerSubject:Historic Sites InventoryAddress:332 Woodside AvenueProject Number:PL-14-02555Date:April 1, 2015Type of Item:Administrative – Determination of Significance

Summary Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing, and designate the house at 332 Woodside Avenue as a Significant Site on the Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI).

Topic:

Project Name:	332 Woodside Avenue
Applicant:	Park City Municipal Corporation
Owners:	Summit Leasing East LLC
Proposal:	Determination of Significance

Background:

The Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI), adopted February 4, 2009, includes 409 sites of which 192 sites meet the criteria for designation as Landmark Sites and 217 sites meet the criteria for designation as Significant Sites. Since 2009, staff has reviewed Determination of Significance (DOS) applications with the HPB on a case-by-case basis in order to keep the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) current.

One of the goals of the CRSA intensive level survey is to ensure that the Planning Department has a comprehensive list of all historic properties in Park City. This property had been identified by the City's inventory in 1982, yet it was not included in a preliminary study of historic sites in 2006. It is possible that the 1991 garage addition shielded the historic structure from the street and, thus, the property was overlooked as part of the 2009 reconnaissance level survey. A DOS for this property had, for reasons unknown, not been included in the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) adopted in 2009.

The purpose of this DOS is for the HPB to consider including and designating the house at 332 Woodside as Significant on the HSI.

There are no pending applications for this property. The last application the Planning Department received for this property was for a historic district grant in 1992.

History of the Structure:

The one-story wood frame residence at 332 Woodside was constructed between 1900 and 1905. The house was constructed at the bottom of a downhill lot. For this reason, the entrance to the house is located on the south side. The house was clad in drop-

novelty siding and decorated with subtle Victorian Era architectural ornamentation such as the spindled posts and sawn brackets of the front porch. The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) Historic Site Form notes that the structure may have been constructed as a duplex. The site was recognized as a "contributing" site in the Park City Mining Boom Era Residences Thematic District National Register Nomination in 1984.

By 1991, the house had fallen into significant disrepair. The owner considered demolishing the house; however, decided instead to renovate and remodel the structure with the help of a \$5,000 grant from the Park City Historic District Commission. As part of the renovation, then-owner Dr. David S. Morrison elected to construct a garage and additional living space in front of the existing historic structure. The proposed scope of work in the 1992 Grant Application outlines the following:

- Lifting the house and pouring a new 8 ft. tall concrete basement foundation
- Installing a new beam support system tied into the existing floor support system
- Preserving the sheathing and siding materials of the exterior walls
- Reconstructing the porch
- Relocating the structure several feet back in order to accommodate the new garage and parking area
- Constructing a new garage addition with living space below at the front of the property

The house was identified as historic in 1982. It is unclear why the house was overlooked in the 2009 reconnaissance level survey that resulted in the adoption of the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI), other than the fact that it is not easily visible from the street. The home was included on the Park City Museum's annual Historic Homes Tour in 2012.

Analysis and Discussion:

The Historic Preservation Board is authorized by Title 15-11-5(I) to review and take action on the designation of sites within the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI). The Historic Preservation Board may designate sites to the Historic Sites Inventory as a means of providing recognition to and encouraging the preservation of historic sites in the community (LMC 15-11-10). Land Management Code Section 15-11-10(A) sets forth the criteria for designating sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI). The site is currently not listed on the HSI.

Because the house does retain its Essential Historic Form, the evidence supports the conclusion that the house is "Significant".

<u>Significant Site.</u> Any buildings (main, attached, detached or public), accessory buildings and/or structures may be designated to the Historic Sites Inventory as a Significant Site if the Planning Department finds it meets all the criteria listed below:

(a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50) years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and (...) Complies

Based on Sanborn Fire Insurance Map analysis and the April 1982 Historic Site Survey of Park City, staff finds that the structure was originally constructed between 1900 and 1905, making it as much as 115 years old.

(b) It retains its Essential Historical Form, meaning there are no major alterations that have destroyed the Essential Historical Form. Major alterations that destroy the Essential Historical Form include:

(i) Changes in pitch of the main roof of the primary façade if 1) the change was made after the Period of Historic Significance; 2) the change is not due to any structural failure; or 3) the change is not due to collapse as a result of inadequate maintenance on the part of the Applicant or a previous Owner, or (ii) Addition of upper stories or the removal of original upper stories occurred after the Period of Historic Significance, or (iii) Moving it from its original location to a Dissimilar Location, or (iv) Addition(s) that significantly obscures the Essential Historical Form when viewed from the primary public Right-of-Way. **Complies.**

The house retains its Essential Historic Form. The 1991 addition did not significantly impact the historic structure. The new rectangular addition was constructed on the west side of the house, adjacent to the street. The new construction's impact was limited to the west elevation, and did not destroy the historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the site. Further, the new addition was constructed in such a way that, if removed in the future, the Essential Historical Form and integrity of the historic house could be restored.

(c) It is important in local or regional history, architecture, engineering, or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) An era of Historic importance to the community, or

(ii) Lives of Persons who were of Historic importance to the community, or (iii) Noteworthy methods of construction, materials, or craftsmanship used during the Historic period. **Complies.**

This structure contributes to our understanding of Park City's Mature Mining Era (1894-1930). Like many houses of this era, the site is associated with an era of substantial growth in Park City as the town was experiencing its initial boom before the Panic of 1893 and the Great Fire of 1898. The materials used in the original construction—drop novelty wood siding, simple door and window trim—were commonly used during this era.

The criteria for designating sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory as a Landmark Site include:

(a) <u>It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50)</u> years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and **Complies**

- (b) <u>It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location, design, setting, materials,</u> <u>workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the National Park Service for</u> <u>the National Register of Historic Places; and</u> **Does Not Comply**
- (c) <u>It is significant in local, regional or national history, architecture, engineering or</u> <u>culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:</u>
 - (i) <u>An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our</u> <u>history;</u>
 - (ii) <u>The lives of Persons significant in the history of the community, state,</u> <u>region, or nation; or</u>
 - (iii) <u>The distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of construction or</u> <u>the work of a notable architect or master craftsman</u>. **Complies**

Staff finds that the structure at 332 Woodside Avenue meets the standards for local "significant" designation, but does not meet the criteria for "landmark" designation. In order for the site to be designated as "landmark," the structure would have to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places and retain a high level of integrity. The relocation of the structure, the loss of the west wall to accommodate the new addition, and the limited materials salvaged during the 1991 addition have impacted the integrity of the structure to a degree that staff finds would prevent the house from being individually eligible for the National Register of Historic Places.

Process:

The HPB will hear testimony from the applicant and the public and will review the Application for compliance with the "Criteria for Designating Historic Sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory." If the HPB finds that the application does not comply with the criteria set forth in LMC Section 15-11-10(A)(1) or Section 15-11-10(A)(2), the Building and/or structure will not be included on the Historic Sites Inventory. The HPB shall forward a copy of its written findings to the Owner and/or Applicant.

The Applicant or any party participating in the hearing may appeal the Historic Preservation Board decision to the Board of Adjustment. Appeal requests shall be submitted to the Planning Department ten (10) days of the Historic Preservation Board decision. Appeals shall be considered only on the record made before the HPB and will be reviewed for correctness.

Notice:

On March 19, 2015, Legal Notice of this public hearing was published in the Park Record and posted in the required public spaces. Staff sent a mailing notice to the property owner on March 16, 2015 and posted the property on March 16, 2015.

Public Input:

A public hearing, conducted by the Historic Preservation Board, is required prior to adding sites to or removing sites from the Historic Sites Inventory. The public hearing for the recommended action was properly and legally noticed as required by the Land Management Code. No public input was received at the time of writing this report.

Alternatives:

- Conduct a public hearing to consider the DOS for **332 Woodside Avenue** described herein and find the structure at **332 Woodside Avenue** meets the criteria for the designation of "Significant" to the Historic Sites Inventory. according the draft findings of fact and conclusions of law, in whole or in part.
- Conduct a public hearing and find the structure at **332 Woodside Avenue** does not meet the criteria for the designation of "Significant" to the Historic Sites Inventory, and providing specific findings for this action.
- Continue the action to a date uncertain.

Significant Impacts:

The structure at 332 Woodside Avenue was not included in the 2009 Historic Sites Inventory. If designated as "Significant" on the HSI, any alterations must comply with the Design Guidelines for Historic Sites; the site will be eligible for the Historic District Grant Program. Should the structure not be included, then the property will be eligible for demolition.

Consequences of not taking the Recommended Action:

If no action is taken, no change will occur to the designation of 332 Woodside Avenue because the house is not currently on the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI). The structure will be eligible for demolition.

If the Historic Preservation Board chooses to include this site on the HSI, the structure will be designated a Significant Historic site and not eligible for demolition. It will be eligible for the Historic District Grant Program.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing, and designate the house at 332 Woodside Avenue as a Significant Site on the Park City Historic Sites Inventory.

Finding of Fact:

- 1. The Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI), adopted February 4, 2009, includes 409 sites of which 192 sites meet the criteria for designation as Landmark Sites and 217 sites meet the criteria for designation as Significant Sites. This site was not included on the 2009 HSI.
- 2. The house at 332 Woodside Avenue is within the Historic Residential-1 (HR-1) zoning district.
- 3. The residential structure at 332 Woodside Avenue was not included in the 2009 HSI.
- 4. There is wood-frame, rectangular, pyramid-roof cottage at 332 Woodside Avenue.
- The existing house has been in existence at 332 Woodside Avenue since 1905. The structure appears in the 1907, 1929, and 1941 Sanborn Fire Insurance maps. A 1904-1905 tax photo of Park City also demonstrates that the overall form of the structure has not been altered.

- 6. The house was built between 1900 and 1905, during the Settlement and Mining Boom Era (1868-1893).
- 7. In 1991, the house was relocated several feet to the rear of the lot in order to accommodate construction of a new garage addition at the front of the lot. As part of this renovation, the house was also lifted to accommodate a new basement addition, the porch reconstructed, and structural improvements were made.
- 8. The house is clad in drop novelty siding, simple wood trim, and Victorian Erainspired details reminiscent of the Settlement and Mining Boom Era.
- 9. The structure is rectangular in plan and typical of the types of residential structures built during the Settlement and Mining Boom Era. Further, pyramid-roof cottages were part of a national Romantic movement towards the picturesque and dynamic plans found in Victorian art and architecture.
- 10. The site meets the criteria as Significant on the City's Historic Sites Inventory.
- 11. Built between 1900 and 1905, the structure is over fifty (50) years old and has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50) years.
- 12. Though the 1991 garage addition has altered the view of the historic structure from the right-of-way, historic structure has retained its Essential Historical Form. The Land Management Code defines the Essential Historical Form as the physical characteristics of a Structure that make it identifiable as existing in or relating to an important era in the past.
- 13. The house is important in local or regional history because it is associated with an era of historic importance to the community, the Settlement and Mining Boom Era (1868-1893).
- 14. Staff finds that the structure at 332 Woodside Avenue meets the standards for local "significant" designation, but does not meet the criteria for "landmark" designation. In order for the site to be designated as "landmark," the structure would have to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places and retain a high level of integrity.

Conclusions of Law:

The existing structure located at 332 Woodside Avenue meets all of the criteria for a Significant Site as set forth in LMC Section 15-11-10(A)(2) which includes:
 (a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50) years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and Complies.

(b) It retains its Essential Historical Form, meaning there are no major alterations that have destroyed the Essential Historical Form. Major alterations that destroy the Essential Historical Form include: **Complies.**

(i) Changes in pitch of the main roof of the primary façade if 1) the change was made after the Period of Historic Significance; 2) the change is not due to any structural failure; or 3) the change is not due to collapse as a result of inadequate maintenance on the part of the Applicant or a previous Owner, or

(ii) Addition of upper stories or the removal of original upper stories occurred after the Period of Historic Significance, or

(iii) Moving it from its original location to a Dissimilar Location, or

(iv) Addition(s) that significantly obscures the Essential Historical Form when viewed from the primary public Right-of-Way.

- (c) It is important in local or regional history, architecture, engineering, or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following: **Complies.**
 - (i) An era of Historic importance to the community, or

(ii) Lives of Persons who were of Historic importance to the community, or (iii) Noteworthy methods of construction, materials, or craftsmanship used during the Historic period.

- 2. The existing structure located at 332 Woodside Avenue does not meet all of the criteria for designating sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory as a Landmark Site including:
 - a. <u>It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty</u> (50) years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and **Complies.**
 - b. <u>It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location, design, setting, materials,</u> <u>workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the National Park</u> <u>Service for the National Register of Historic Places; and Does Not</u> **Comply.**
 - c. <u>It is significant in local, regional or national history, architecture, engineering</u> or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:
 - *i.* <u>An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad</u> <u>patterns of our history;</u>
 - *ii.* <u>The lives of Persons significant in the history of the community,</u> <u>state, region, or nation; or</u>
 - *iii.* <u>The distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of</u> <u>construction or the work of a notable architect or master</u> <u>craftsman</u>. **Complies.**

Exhibits:

Exhibit A – Historic Sites Inventory Form, 2014

Exhibit B – Historic District Architecture Survey Form, 1982

HISTORIC SITE FORM – HISTORIC SITES INVENTORY

PARK CITY MUNICIPAL CORPORATION (10-08)

1 IDENTIFICATION

Name of Property: House at 332 Woodside Avenue

Address: 332 Woodside Avenue

City, County: Park City, Summit County, Utah

Current Owner Name: Summit Leasing East LLC

Current Owner Address: 5570 Naples Canal, Long Beach, CA 90803

Legal Description (include acreage): PC 49 ALL LOTS 24 & 25 BLK 3 PARK CITY SURVEY 4 AMI-371 1956-2 IQC-561 600-325

2 STATUS/USE

Property Category ▷ building(s), main □ building(s), attached □ building(s), detached □ building(s), public □ building(s), accessory □ structure(s)	Evaluation* ☐ Landmark Site ⊠ Significant Site ☐ Not Historic *National Register of ☐ listed (date:)	Reconstruction Date: Permit #: Full Partial f Historic Places: el	<u>Use</u> Original Use: single dwelling Current Use: single dwelling igible ⊠ ineligible
3 DOCUMENTATION			
<u>Photos: Dates</u> ☐ tax photo: ⊠ prints: Nov. 2014 (3) ⊠ historic: c. 1905	⊠ abstract of □ tax card	f title ilding permit	es consulted, whether useful or not) city/county histories personal interviews Utah Hist. Research Center USHS preservation files
<u>Drawings and Plans</u> ☐ measured floor plans ☐ site sketch map ☐ Historic American Bldg. Sur ☐ original plans: ☐ other:	vey 🛛 🖾 census red	idex pry/gazetteers cords cal encyclopedias	 ☐ USHS architects file ☐ LDS Family History Library ☑ Park City Hist. Soc./Museum ☐ university library(ies): ☐ other:

<u>Bibliographical References</u> (books, articles, interviews, etc.). Attach copies of all research notes and materials Carter, Thomas and Peter Goss. Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940. Salt Lake City: Center for Architectural Studies, Graduate School of Architecture, University of Utah and Utah State Historical Society, 1988.

Hampshire, David, Martha Sonntag Bradley and Allen Roberts. *A History of Summit County*. Coalville, UT: Summit County Commission, 1998.

National Register of Historic Places. Park City Main Street Historic District. Park City, Utah, National Register #79002511.

Peterson, Marie Ross and Mary M. Pearson. *Echoes of Yesterday: Summit County Centennial History*. Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1947.

Randall, Deborah Lyn. Park City, Utah: An Architectural History of Mining Town Housing, 1869 to 1907. Master of Arts thesis, University of Utah, 1985.

Thompson, George A., and Fraser Buck. *Treasure Mountain Home: Park City Revisited*. Salt Lake City: Dream Garden Press, 1993.



Tax Number. PC-49

Parent Parcel(s): N/A

4 ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION AND INTEGRITY

Building Type and/or Style: Pyramid house type, Victorian Eclectic style No. Stories: 2

Additions: none minor major (describe below) *Alterations*: none minor major (describe below)

Number of associated outbuilding and/or structures: accessory building(s), # <u>0</u>; structure(s), # <u>0</u>.

General Condition of Exterior Materials:

Good: Well-maintained with no serious problems apparent

Fair: Some problems are apparent. *Describe the problems*:

Poor: Major problems are apparent and constitute and imminent threat. *Describe the problems:*

Uninhabitable/Ruin

Materials: (The physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time in a particular pattern or configuration. Describe the materials.)

Foundation: concrete

Walls: drop wood siding

Roof: asphalt shingles

Windows/Doors: double-hung windows (typical) and paneled wood doors with wooden trim

Essential Historical Form: X retains D does not retain

Location: Original location is moved (date: 1991, original location: It was moved several feet to the rear of the property to accommodate the new garage and parking area as part of the 1991 renovation)

Design: This house is composed of two volumes, each of which is rectangular with a modified pyramid roof that is flat on the top, rather than coming to a central point. The lower (east) volume is the historic house portion, while the upper (west) volume is a two-car garage that was added much later. The house has a porch on its south façade which served as the main entrance before the garage was added. Spindled posts and sawn brackets convey the Victorian style of the house. A lower level and foundation were added to the house in 1991.

Setting: Set on an east-facing hillside in Old Town Park City. The site overlooks historic Main Street and is on a double-wide 50'x75' lot within the original Park City survey. With small lots, maximized construction, and narrow streets, the neighborhood is relatively dense for a single-family zoned area.

Workmanship: Utilizes typical materials and assemblies of a Park City residence built during the early twentieth century. Namely, drop wood siding was the preferred wall material of this era and most houses are topped with asphalt shingle roofs. The subtle window and door trim, as well as the patio post and bracket details convey a sense of Victorianism, which was popular at the time of construction.

Feeling: The addition of a two-car garage in 1991 to the front of the house has reduced its historical integrity to a degree, but the house itself is historic and appears to be in good condition. The basement was added after the construction of the house, but it detracts little from its original character. Skylights have also been added to the historic portion of the house but are not apparent from the street.

Association: The pyramid house type replaced T-cottages as the most popular house form in Park City in the late 1890s, and most of the town's pyramid houses were built between 1895 and 1905.¹ The popularity of this house type is often associated with a popular classical revival as a reaction against the picturesque sentiment of Queen Anne architecture. In Park City, these houses were popular coincidentally with the rebuilding of the town after the Panic of 1893 and the Great Fire of 1898. It is associated, therefore, with the slight boom in housing Park City experienced around the turn of the century.

5 SIGNIFICANCE

Architect: \square not known \square known: (source:)

Date of Construction: 1900-1905

Builder: 🛛 not known 🗌 known: (source:)

The site must represent an important part of the history or architecture of the community. A site need only be significant under one of the three areas listed below:

1. Historic Era:

Settlement and Mining Boom Era (1868-1893)

Mature Mining Era (1894-1930)

Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry (1931-1962)

Description of historic era: By the 1890s, Park City was a *bona fide* mining town, with a railroad station, post office, fire department, and growing school system. While individuals lost and gained jobs based on fluctuating silver prices, the mining industry was relatively stable in Park City through the 1920s. The Great Fire of 1898 proved the strength of the town: while Main Street was almost completely levelled and sustained over \$1,000,000 in damages, most of the buildings were rebuilt by 1900. Unlike other fire ravaged western mining towns, which often went permanently bust over similar blazes, the demand for Park City silver caused a rapid rebuilding of the business district. Park City survived the Spanish Flu Epidemic, World War I, and Prohibition mostly unscathed, boasting over 4,000 residents in the 1930 United States Census.

- 2. Persons: N/A
- 3. Architecture: N/A

6 PHOTOS

Photographs on the following pages (taken by the researcher, unless noted otherwise):

Photo No. 1: Southwest oblique. Camera facing northeast. November 2014.

Photo No. 2: Northwest oblique. Camera facing southeast. November 2014.

Photo No. 3: Northeast oblique. Camera facing southwest. November 2014.

Photo No. 4: Overall view of Park City from Masonic Hill. Camera facing west. 1904-1905. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)

Photo No. 5: Detail of Photo No. 4, overall view of Park City from Masonic Hill. Camera facing west. 1904-1905. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)

¹ Randall, 100.



Photo No. 1: Southwest oblique. Camera facing northeast. November 2014.

Photo No. 2: Northwest oblique. Camera facing southeast. November 2014.



Photo No. 3: Northeast oblique. Camera facing southwest. November 2014.



Photo No. 4: Overall view of Park City from Masonic Hill. Camera facing west. 1904-1905. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)



Photo No. 5: Detail of Photo No. 4, overall view of Park City from Masonic Hill. Camera facing west. 1904-1905. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)



Exhibit B	W 59 13
PARK CITY SURVEY WORKSHEET	SITE NO. PC 49
	Subdivision Block_3Lot(s)_24-25
Owner Clarence & Jessie Johnson Owner Address P.O. Box 124 Park City, Utah 84 PRIMARY STRUCTURE	Present Zoning <u>HR-1</u> 060
PRIMARY STRUCTURE	View SW oblique

Date	of	photo	11/81	
Negat	ive	File	14/5	

Physical description: One-story frame residence with lower level; rectangular with hip roof; attached porch with turned posts; various openings; interior chimney.

Features of interest: Position on lot - below street level.

Building materials: wood frame Building type/style hip roof

Modifications: None to minor X Moderate Major

Explain: Porch balustera.

Condition: Excellent _____ Good X to Fair X Deteriorated _____

Comment	:

Present use: _____residential _____Original use: ____residential _____

SIGNIFICANCE OF PRIMARY STRUCTURE

Individual landmark_____Typical example <u>x</u> Contributes to district <u>x</u>

PARK CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT SURVEY WORKSHEET	Address <mark>332 Woodside</mark> Site no
SECONDARY STRUCTURE(S)	
Physical description:	
View	
Date of photo Negative file	
Modifications: None to minorModerate	Major
Condition: GoodFair	
Present use:Original us	
original us	e:
COMMENT :	
COMMENT:	07 Alterations:
HISTORICAL DATA Date of construction/primary structure: <u>bet. 1900-</u> Sources for documentation: <u>See Mate surv</u>	07 Alterations:
COMMENT:	07 Alterations: ey_form.
HISTORICAL DATA Date of construction/primary structure: <u>bet. 1900</u> - Sources for documentation: <u>See Mate mun</u> Original owner: Additional information of interest (attach length	07 Alterations: ey_form.
SIGNIFICANCE OF SITE TO DISTRICT	07Alterations: ey form. y histories):
SIGNIFICANCE OF SITE TO DISTRICT	07 Alterations: ey_form. y histories):
Additional information of interest (attach length SIGNIFICANCE OF SITE TO DISTRICT Significant Contribut Primary structure, pre-1930 X	07Alterations: ey form. y histories):
Additional information of interest (attach length SIGNIFICANCE OF SITE TO DISTRICT Secondary structure, pre-1930 X	07Alterations: ey form. y histories):
Additional information of interest (attach length SIGNIFICANCE OF SITE TO DISTRICT Secondary structure, post-1930 Secondary structure, post-1930	07Alterations: y form: y histories): tory Non-contributory Intrusio
Additional information of interest (attach length SIGNIFICANCE OF SITE TO DISTRICT Secondary structure, pre-1930 Secondary structure, post-1930 Comment:	07Alterations: y form: y histories): tory Non-contributory Intrusion
Additional information of interest (attach length SIGNIFICANCE OF SITE TO DISTRICT Secondary structure, post-1930	07Alterations: y form: y histories): tory Non-contributory Intrusion



Historic Preservation Board Staff Report

Author:Hannah Turpen, PlannerSubject:Historic Sites InventoryAddress:1259 Norfolk AvenueProject Number:PL-15-02645Date:April 1, 2015Type of Item:Administrative – Determination of Significance

Summary Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing and approve the status of 1259 Norfolk Avenue as a Significant Site on the Park City Historic Sites Inventory.

Topic:

Project Name:	1259 Norfolk Avenue
Applicant:	Park City Municipal Corporation
Owners:	Maureen Barbara Moriarty (Trustee)
Proposal:	Determination of Significance

Background:

The Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI), adopted February 4, 2009, includes 409 sites of which 192 sites meet the criteria for designation as Landmark Sites and 217 sites meet the criteria for designation as Significant Sites. Since 2009, staff has reviewed Determination of Significance (DOS) applications with the HPB on a case-by-case basis in order to keep the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) current.

One of the goals of the CRSA intensive level survey is to ensure that the Planning Department has a comprehensive list of all historic properties in Park City, and this DOS is for a property that had, not been included in the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) adopted in 2009. The 2009 reconnaissance level survey was a "windshield survey." A windshield survey is an architectural survey generally conducted from a moving vehicle. Because the 2009 reconnaissance level survey was conducted from a moving vehicle, it is very likely that this structure was overlooked at that time as most of the structures on that section on Norfolk Avenue are non-historic.

The purpose of this DOS is for the HPB to consider including and designating the house at 1259 Norfolk Avenue as "Significant" on the HSI.

There have been a number of past applications for 1259 Norfolk Avenue. In 1996, the roof was repaired. In 2002, there was a lower level garage addition and new concrete foundation installed. There are no current applications, except for this DOS, for this property.

History of the Structure:

The house at 1259 Norfolk Avenue was initially constructed circa 1900. 1259 Norfolk Avenue was located outside of the Sanborn Fire Insurance map boundary prior to 1907. It first appears on the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance map. According to the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, sometime between 1907 and 1929, a porch was added on the east and south facades of the house.



The dashed circle shows the originally documented shape of 1259 Norfolk Avenue in 1907.



The dashed circle shows the altered shape of 1259 Norfolk Avenue in 1929.

The house is a rectangular cabin type that has been modified. The front porch was added between 1907 and 1929. Originally, the house was two rectangular volumes, the front (east) living space and the back (west) bedroom wing. The front patio was added before the 1929 Sanborn Map of Park City and remains an important historical element of the house. The roof was repaired in 1996, but the repair did not alter the historic roof form. The garage and concrete foundation were added in 2002, but they do not detract significantly from its historic feel and appearance.

The exterior walls are clad in wood drop siding on the upper level (historic portion) and board and batten wood siding on the lower garage level. The roof is clad in asphalt



shingles, which based on Building Permit records, was likely completed in 1996. The windows are double-hung which are typical of the historic period and the doors are paneled wood with wooden trim, also typical of the historic period.



Overall view of Park City. Camera facing northwest. 1904-05. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)



Close-up of overall view of Park City facing northwest. 1904-05. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)

Southeast oblique. Camera facing northwest. November 2014.

Analysis and Discussion:

The Historic Preservation Board is authorized by Title 15-11-5(I) to review and take action on the designation of sites within the Historic Sites Inventory (HSI). The Historic Preservation Board may designate sites to the Historic Sites Inventory as a means of providing recognition to and encouraging the preservation of historic sites in the community (LMC 15-11-10). Land Management Code Section 15-11-10(A) sets forth the criteria for designating sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI). The site is currently not listed on the HSI.

Because the home retains its historic form, the evidence supports the conclusion that the home is "Significant."

Significant Site. Any buildings (main, attached, detached or public), accessory buildings and/or structures may be designated to the Historic Sites Inventory as a Significant Site if the Planning Department finds it meets all the criteria listed below:

(a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50) years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and (...) Complies

The structure was originally constructed in c.1900, which makes the structure 115 years old.

(b) It retains its Essential Historical Form, meaning there are no major alterations that have destroyed the Essential Historical Form. Major alterations that destroy the Essential Historical Form include:

(i) Changes in pitch of the main roof of the primary façade if 1) the change was made after the Period of Historic Significance; 2) the change is not due to any structural failure; or 3) the change is not due to collapse as a result of inadequate maintenance on the part of the Applicant or a previous Owner, or (ii) Addition of upper stories or the removal of original upper stories occurred after the Period of Historic Significance, or (iii) Moving it from its original location to a Dissimilar Location, or (iv) Addition(s) that significantly obscures the Essential Historical Form when

viewed from the primary public Right-of-Way. Complies.

The house retains its Essential Historic Form. In 1996, there was a roof repair that did not alter the historic roof form. In 2002, a lower level garage addition and concrete foundation were added to the historic structure. The garage and concrete foundation are recent additions to the house, but they do not detract significantly from its Essential Historic Form when viewed from the public Right-of-Way. The basic historic massing and the original house is readily apparent form the exterior and the pre-1929 front patio is historic despite not being original.

(c) It is important in local or regional history, architecture, engineering, or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:

(i) An era of Historic importance to the community, or

(ii) Lives of Persons who were of Historic importance to the community, or

(iii) Noteworthy methods of construction, materials, or craftsmanship used during the Historic period. **Complies.**

The structure contributes to our understanding of Park City's Mature Mining Era (1894-1930). Rectangular cabins were the first popular housing type in Park City after log cabins and one room shacks of the initial silver discover era of the 1870s. This property was not included in the Sanborn Maps until the 1907 addition because of its location in the outskirts of town around 1900. The 1904-05 photograph of Park City facing northeast shows the structure and only a handful of others across from the historic baseball grounds. The structure utilizes typical materials and assemblies of a Park City residence built during the early twentieth century. Such materials and assemblies include drop wood siding, subtle window and door trim, patio posts and bracket details that convey a sense of Victorianism, and board and batten siding. The criteria for designating sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory as a Landmark Site include:

- (a) <u>It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50)</u> years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and **Complies**.
- (b) <u>It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location, design, setting, materials,</u> workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the National Park Service for the National Register of Historic Places; and **Does Not Comply.**
- (c) <u>It is significant in local, regional or national history, architecture, engineering or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:</u>
 - (i) An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our <u>history;</u>
 - (ii) <u>The lives of Persons significant in the history of the community, state,</u> <u>region, or nation; or</u>
 - (iii) <u>The distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of construction or</u> <u>the work of a notable architect or master craftsman</u>. **Complies.**

Staff finds that the structure at 1259 Norfolk Avenue meets the standards for local "significant" designation, but does not meet the criteria for "landmark" designation. In order for the site to be designated as "landmark," the structure would have to retain its historic integrity in terms of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. Moreover, "landmark" designation indicates that it would be eligible for the National Register. Due to the additions and loss of its historic materials, the structure is no longer eligible for the National Register of Historic Places.

Process:

The HPB will hear testimony from the applicant and the public and will review the Application for compliance with the "Criteria for Designating Historic Sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory." If the HPB finds that the application does not comply with the criteria set forth in LMC Section 15-11-10(A)(1) or Section 15-11-10(A)(2), the Building and/or structure will not be included on the Historic Sites Inventory. The HPB shall forward a copy of its written findings to the Owner and/or Applicant.

The Applicant or any party participating in the hearing may appeal the Historic Preservation Board decision to the Board of Adjustment. Appeal requests shall be submitted to the Planning Department ten (10) days of the Historic Preservation Board decision. Appeals shall be considered only on the record made before the HPB and will be reviewed for correctness.

Notice:

On March 19, 2015, Legal Notice of this public hearing was published in the Park Record and posted in the required public spaces. Staff sent a mailing notice to property owners on March 16, 2015 and posted the property on March 16, 2015.

Public Input:

A public hearing, conducted by the Historic Preservation Board, is required prior to adding sites to or removing sites from the Historic Sites Inventory. The public hearing

for the recommended action was properly and legally noticed as required by the Land Management Code. No public input was received at the time of writing this report.

Alternatives:

- Conduct a public hearing to consider the DOS for **1259 Norfolk Avenue** described herein and find the structure at **1259 Norfolk Avenue** meets the criteria for the designation of "Significant" to the Historic Sites Inventory according the draft findings of fact and conclusions of law, in whole or in part.
- Conduct a public hearing and find the structure at **1259 Norfolk Avenue** does not meet the criteria for the designation of "Significant" to the Historic Sites Inventory, and providing specific findings for this action.
- Continue the action to a date uncertain.

Significant Impacts:

The house at 1259 Norfolk Avenue was not included in the 2009 Historic Sites Inventory. If designated as "Significant" on the HSI, any alterations must comply with the Design Guidelines for Historic Sites and the site will be eligible for the Historic District Grant Program. Should the structure not be included, then the property will be eligible for demolition.

Consequences of not taking the Recommended Action:

If no action is taken, no change will occur to the designation of 1259 Norfolk Avenue because the house is not currently on the Historic Sites Inventory. The structure will be eligible for demolition.

If the Historic Preservation Board chooses to include this site on the HSI, the structure will be designated a Significant Historic site and not eligible for demolition. It will be eligible for the Historic District Grant Program.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board review the application, conduct a public hearing, and consider designating the house at 1259 Norfolk Avenue as a Significant Site on the Park City Historic Sites Inventory.

Finding of Fact:

- 1. The Park City Historic Sites Inventory (HSI), adopted February 4, 2009, includes 409 sites of which 192 sites meet the criteria for designation as Landmark Sites and 217 sites meet the criteria for designation as Significant Sites. This site was not included on the 2009 HSI.
- 2. The house at 1259 Norfolk Avenue is within the Recreation Commercial (RC) zoning district.
- 3. The structure has been in existence at 1259 Norfolk Avenue since circa 1900. The structure appears in the 1907, 1929, and 1941 Sanborn Fire Insurance maps. The structure does not appear in a 1941 tax photograph.
- 4. The structure is not currently designated as a Significant or Landmark site on the 2009 Historic Sites Inventory.

- 5. The original rectangular cabin was constructed within the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) and is historic. The lower level garage addition and new foundation were added after the Period of Historic Significance and are non-historic.
- 6. Though out of period, the 2002 lower level garage addition and new foundation do not detract from the historic significance of the structure and its Essential Historic Form.
- 7. The original exterior siding and ornamental detailing of the porch are remaining on the exterior of the house. The roofing materials, concrete foundation, and modern garage door are indicative of alterations outside of the historic period.
- 8. The front (east) façade retains its original windows with the exception of one (1) non-historic window on the lower level.
- 9. The structure is a rectangular cabin typical of the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930).
- 10. The site meets the criteria as Significant on the City's Historic Sites Inventory.
- 11. Built circa 1900, the structure is over fifty (50) years old and has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50) years.
- 12. Though the structure's historic integrity has been diminished due to the out-ofperiod addition and alterations to its historic materials, it has retained its Essential Historical Form. The out-of-period addition to the east elevation of the structure does not detract from its historic significance.
- 13. The structure is important in local or regional history because it is associated with an era of historic importance to the community, the Mature Mining Era (1894-1930) and its noteworthy method of construction, materials, and craftsmanship of the Mature Mining Era.
- 14. The site does not meet the criteria as Landmark on the City's Historic Sites Inventory.

Conclusions of Law

 The existing structure located at 1259 Norfolk Avenue meets all of the criteria for a Significant Site as set forth in LMC Section 15-11-10(A)(2) which includes:
 (a) It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past fifty (50) years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community; and Complies.

(b) It retains its Essential Historical Form, meaning there are no major alterations that have destroyed the Essential Historical Form. Major alterations that destroy the Essential Historical Form include: **Complies.**

(i) Changes in pitch of the main roof of the primary façade if 1) the change was made after the Period of Historic Significance; 2) the change is not due to any structural failure; or 3) the change is not due to collapse as a result of inadequate maintenance on the part of the Applicant or a previous Owner, or

(ii) Addition of upper stories or the removal of original upper stories occurred after the Period of Historic Significance, or

(iii) Moving it from its original location to a Dissimilar Location, or

(iv) Addition(s) that significantly obscures the Essential Historical Form when viewed from the primary public Right-of-Way.

(c) It is important in local or regional history, architecture, engineering, or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following: **Complies.**

(i) An era of Historic importance to the community, or

(ii) Lives of Persons who were of Historic importance to the community, or (iii) Noteworthy methods of construction, materials, or craftsmanship used during the Historic period.

- 2. The existing structure located at 1259 Norfolk Avenue does not meet all of the criteria for designating sites to the Park City Historic Sites Inventory as a Landmark Site including:
 - a. <u>It is at least fifty (50) years old or has achieved Significance in the past</u> <u>fifty (50) years if the Site is of exceptional importance to the community;</u> <u>and</u> **Complies.**
 - b. <u>It retains its Historic Integrity in terms of location, design, setting,</u> <u>materials, workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the</u> <u>National Park Service for the National Register of Historic Places; and</u> **Does Not Comply.**
 - c. <u>It is significant in local, regional or national history, architecture,</u> <u>engineering or culture associated with at least one (1) of the following:</u>
 - *i.* <u>An era that has made a significant contribution to the broad</u> patterns of our history;
 - *ii.* <u>The lives of Persons significant in the history of the community,</u> <u>state, region, or nation; or</u>
 - *iii.* <u>The distinctive characteristics of type, period, or method of</u> <u>construction or the work of a notable architect or master</u> <u>craftsman</u>. **Complies.**

Exhibits:

Exhibit A – Historic Sites Inventory Form, 2014

HISTORIC SITE FORM – HISTORIC SITES INVENTORY

PARK CITY MUNICIPAL CORPORATION (10-08)

A.K.A.:

Tax Number, 1259-NOR-1

Parent Parcel(s): SA-193

1 IDENTIFICATION

Name of Property: House at 1259 Norfolk Avenue

Address: 1259 Norfolk Avenue

City, County: Park City, Summit County, Utah

Current Owner Name: Maureen Barbara Moriarty (trustee)

Current Owner Address: PO Box 242, Park City, UT 84060-0242

Legal Description (include acreage): LOT 1, 1259 NORFOLK AVENUE SUBDIVISION; ACCORDING TO THE OFFICIAL PLAT ON FILE IN THE SUMMIT COUNTY RECORDERS OFFICE CONT 3300 SQ FT OR 0.08 AC [...] (see record for complete legal description)

2 STATUS/USE

Property Category building(s), main building(s), attached building(s), detached building(s), public building(s), accessory structure(s)	Evaluation* ☐ Landmark Site ⊠ Significant Site ☐ Not Historic *National Register of ☐ listed (date:)	Reconstruction Date: Permit #: ☐ Full ☐ Partial f Historic Places: ⊠ elig	Use Original Use: single dwelling Current Use: single dwelling ible ineligible
3 DOCUMENTATION			
Photos: Dates ☐ tax photo: ☑ prints: Nov. 2014 (2) ☑ historic: c. 1905 Drawings and Plans ☐ measured floor plans ☐ site sketch map ☐ Historic American Bldg. Sur ☐ original plans: ☑ other: lot survey (7/28/2003)	✓ abstract of ☐ tax card ☐ original bu ☐ sewer perr ✓ Sanborn m ☐ obituary in ☐ city director ✓ census rec ☐ biographic	f title ilding permit mit naps dex ory/gazetteers cords al encyclopedias	 consulted, whether useful or not) city/county histories personal interviews Utah Hist. Research Center USHS preservation files USHS architects file LDS Family History Library Park City Hist. Soc./Museum university library(ies): other:

<u>Bibliographical References</u> (books, articles, interviews, etc.). Attach copies of all research notes and materials Carter, Thomas and Peter Goss. Utah's Historic Architecture, 1847-1940. Salt Lake City: Center for Architectural Studies, Graduate School of Architecture, University of Utah and Utah State Historical Society, 1988.

Hampshire, David, Martha Sonntag Bradley and Allen Roberts. *A History of Summit County*. Coalville, UT: Summit County Commission, 1998.

National Register of Historic Places. Park City Main Street Historic District. Park City, Utah, National Register #79002511.

Peterson, Marie Ross and Mary M. Pearson. *Echoes of Yesterday: Summit County Centennial History*. Salt Lake City: Daughters of Utah Pioneers, 1947.

Randall, Deborah Lyn. *Park City, Utah: An Architectural History of Mining Town Housing, 1869 to 1907.* Master of Arts thesis, University of Utah, 1985.

Thompson, George A., and Fraser Buck. *Treasure Mountain Home: Park City Revisited*. Salt Lake City: Dream Garden Press, 1993.

4 ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION AND INTEGRITY

Building Type and/or Style: rectangular cabin type, Victorian Eclectic style No. Stories: 1

Additions: none minor major (describe below) *Alterations*: none minor major (describe below)

Number of associated outbuilding and/or structures: \Box accessory building(s), # <u>0</u>; \Box structure(s), # <u>0</u>.

General Condition of Exterior Materials:

Good: Well-maintained with no serious problems apparent

Fair: Some problems are apparent. *Describe the problems*:

Poor: Major problems are apparent and constitute and imminent threat. *Describe the problems:*

Uninhabitable/Ruin

Materials:

Foundation: concrete

Walls: drop wood siding, board and batten wood siding on lower level garage

Roof: asphalt shingles

Windows/Doors: double-hung windows (typical) and paneled wood doors with wooden trim

Essential Historical Form: X retains Odes not retain

Location: 🛛 original location 🗌 moved (date: , original location:)

- Design: This is a rectangular cabin type that has been modified and updated to include a concrete foundation and a garage in the lower level. Originally, the house was two rectangular volumes, the front (east) living space and the back (west) bedroom wing. The front patio was added before the 1929 Sanborn Map of Park City and remains an important historical element of the house. The garage and concrete foundation were recent alterations to the house, but they do not detract significantly from its historic feel and appearance.
- Setting: Set in the north end of Old Town Park City, facing a greensward that was once the historic baseball field for the town. It is on a 44'x75' lot, about one-and-a-half of the original Snyder's Addition parcels. The setting has changed somewhat with surrounding growth from typical miner's cabins to larger condominiums and hotels. Located close to the base of Park City Mountain Resort, the setting is more developed than it was historically but maintains a degree of historic integrity, especially in its relationship to the historic ball field across the street.
- *Workmanship*: This house utilizes typical materials and assemblies of a Park City residence built during the early twentieth century. Namely, drop wood siding was the preferred wall material of this era and most houses are topped with asphalt shingle roofs. The subtle window and door trim, as well as the patio post and bracket details convey a sense of Victorianism, which was popular at the time of construction. The lower addition is clad in board-and-batten siding, which was employed in the historic period, although it was used to a lesser degree than drop wood siding.
- *Feeling*: Retains its historic integrity despite the addition of a lower level garage and new concrete foundation. The basic historic massing of the original house is readily apparent from the exterior, and the pre-1929 front patio is historic despite not being original. Despite surrounding development, the site retains its historic feel, as well.

Association: Rectangular cabins were the first popular housing type in Park City after the log cabins and oneroom shacks of the initial silver discovery era of the 1870s. Over 80% of the rectangular cabins in Park City were built before the 1889 Sanborn Map.¹ This house was not included in the Sanborns until the 1907 addition, as it was near the outskirts of the original town. A 1904-05 photograph shows this house with only a handful of others across from the historic baseball grounds. It is unknown who built the house and the exact date of construction, but it was definitely before 1905 and probably around the turn of the century.

5 SIGNIFICANCE

Architect: \square not known \square known: (source:)

Date of Construction: c. 1900

Builder: 🛛 not known 🗌 known: (source:)

The site must represent an important part of the history or architecture of the community. A site need only be significant under one of the three areas listed below:

1. Historic Era:

Settlement and Mining Boom Era (1868-1893) Mature Mining Era (1894-1930)

Mining Decline and Emergence of Recreation Industry (1931-1962)

Description of historic era: By the 1890s, Park City was a *bona fide* mining town, with a railroad station, post office, fire department, and growing school system. While individuals lost and gained jobs based on fluctuating silver prices, the mining industry was relatively stable in Park City through the 1920s. The Great Fire of 1898 proved the strength of the town: while Main Street was almost completely levelled and sustained over \$1,000,000 in damages, most of the buildings were rebuilt by 1900. Unlike other fire ravaged western mining towns, which often went permanently bust over similar blazes, the demand for Park City silver caused a rapid rebuilding of the business district. Park City survived the Spanish Flu Epidemic, World War I, and Prohibition mostly unscathed, boasting over 4,000 residents in the 1930 United States Census.

- 2. Persons: N/A
- 3. Architecture: N/A

6 PHOTOS

Photographs on the following pages (taken by the researcher, unless noted otherwise):

Photo No. 1: Northeast oblique. Camera facing southwest. November 2014.

Photo No. 2: Southeast oblique. Camera facing northwest. November 2014.

Photo No. 3: Overall view of Park City. Camera facing northwest. 1904-05. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)

Photo No. 4: Close-up of Photo No. 3 (Overall view of Park City. Camera facing northwest. 1904-05). (Park City Historical Society & Museum)

¹ Randall, 67.

Photo No. 1: Northeast oblique. Camera facing southwest. November 2014.



Photo No. 2: Southeast oblique. Camera facing northwest. November 2014.



Photo No. 3: Overall view of Park City. Camera facing northwest. 1904-05. (Park City Historical Society & Museum)



Photo No. 4: Close-up of Photo No. 3 (Overall view of Park City. Camera facing northwest. 1904-05). (Park City Historical Society & Museum)

