

Historic Preservation Board Staff Report



Subject: Design Guideline Revisions
Author: Anya Grahn, Planner
Hannah Turpen, Planner
Date: January 6, 2016
Type of Item: Regular Session
Project Number: GI-13-00222

Summary Recommendations

Staff has committed to routinely reviewing the existing Design Guidelines for Historic Districts and Historic Sites. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) take public comment on the proposed changes to the *Design Guidelines for Park City's Historic Districts and Historically Significant Buildings*; provide specific amendments to be made to the document if necessary; and make a recommendation to City Council. (A final review of the Design Guideline changes will be requested prior to forwarding a recommendation to City Council.)

Staff requests that the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) read and familiarize themselves with the existing Design Guidelines to prepare for this work session. The Design Guidelines are available online at:

<http://www.parkcity.org/home/showdocument?id=62>.

Background

Historic preservation code provisions date back to approximately 1982. In the early 1990s, the City expanded regulations governing demolition of commercial properties, primarily on Main Street, and soon after extended protections to residential properties on the initial survey or over 50 years old, subject to a determination of significance hearing. In 2007, the City contracted Preservation Solutions to conduct a reconnaissance level, or "windshield," survey of the historic district. This increased our current preservation program in which some 400 sites and structures were designated as historic on the City's Historic Sites Inventory (HSI) and the adoption of the 2009 *Design Guidelines for Historic Districts and Historic Sites*. Owners of properties on the HSI may not demolish buildings or structures designated as historic unless warranted by economic hardship; however, reconstruction and panelization may be deemed necessary and approved by the Historic Preservation Board if specified criteria are met as defined in the LMC. The City has been successful in encouraging historic preservation through a "carrot and stick" approach, which includes the Historic District Grant Program and LMC exceptions benefitting historic properties.

Purpose of the Design Guidelines

The Design Guidelines provide direction to property owners, architects, designers, builders, developers, City staff, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB), and City Council

in developing proposals that maintain the historic character of Park City's Old Town. The Design Guidelines fulfill policy directives provided in the General Plan and Land Management Code (LMC). Further, these guidelines are a foundation for making decisions and a framework for ensuring consistent procedures and fair deliberations.

The Design Guidelines were envisioned to be a living document. From time to time, the HPB may recommend changes in the Design Guidelines for Park City's Historic Districts and Historic Sites to Council, provided that no changes in the guidelines shall take effect until adopted by a resolution of the City Council. The Guidelines have not been reviewed or revised since their adoption in 2009.

What do they do?

The Design Guidelines are a standard for rehabilitating historic structures, developing historic sites, and constructing new buildings in the commercial and residential neighborhoods of Old Town. The guidelines direct alterations and the design of new construction projects to maintain the historic integrity and character of our historic districts. This allows Park City to maintain its listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

National versus Local Review

The Design Guidelines are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, and Reconstruction. The Standards are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing, and replacing historic materials, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. Park City's Design Guidelines offer general design and technical recommendations to assist in applying the Standards to a specific property. The Secretary of Interior's Standards are generally applied most specifically during tax credit projects, which are reviewed by the National Park Service. The City does not enforce the Secretary of the Interior's Standards; we rely solely on the Design Guidelines.

The Secretary of the Interior, as well as our Design Guidelines, identifies four (4) treatment methods:

- *Preservation*: The act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property. Work, including preliminary measures to protect and stabilize the property, generally focuses upon the ongoing maintenance and repair of historic materials, and features rather than extensive replacement and new construction.
- *Rehabilitation*: The act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.
- *Restoration*: The act or process of accurately depicting the form, features, and character of a property as it appeared at a particular period of time by means of the removal of features from other periods in its history and reconstruction of missing features from the restoration period.

- *Reconstruction*: The act or process of depicting, by means of new construction, the form, features, and detailing of a non-surviving site, landscape, building, structure, or object for the purpose of replicating its appearance at a specific period of time and in its historic location.

Often, a project will utilize several of these methods depending on the condition of the structure and work to be completed.

It is important to note that though our Design Guidelines are based on the Secretary of Interior's Standards, City staff does not utilize the federal standards specifically when reviewing applications.

Past Reviews

Staff began reviewing the Design Guidelines with the HPB in December 2014. Staff met with the HPB to discuss a potential outline for Design Guideline Changes in December 2014. Following this discussion, staff brought forward a work session regarding the treatment of historic structures to discuss panelization and reconstruction in February 2015. In September and October, the HPB discussed compatibility of new additions. Staff also led a discussion with the HPB regarding character zones on October 7, 2015 and November 18, 2015.

Analysis

In December 2014, staff presented a rough outline to the Historic Preservation Board for reorganizing the Design Guidelines (Exhibit A). Using this outline, staff has chosen to focus today's discussion on the following areas of concern within the *Design Guidelines for Historic Residential Structures*:

- Universal Guidelines
- Site Design

Staff has outlined the applicable Design Guidelines that apply to each subject matter. In reviewing Design Guidelines from other cities and towns—including Crested Butte, Colorado; Breckenridge, Colorado; Madison, Indiana; and the 1980 Park City, Utah, Design Guidelines—staff has proposed the following changes to the Park City Design Guidelines as a possible solution.

1. Universal Design Guidelines:

The *Design Guidelines for Historic Sites* in Park City currently recommend the following Universal Design Guidelines:

1. *A site should be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to the distinctive materials and features.*
2. *Changes to a site or building that have acquired historic significance in their own right should be retained and preserved.*
3. *The historic exterior features of a building should be retained and preserved.*
4. *Distinctive materials, components, finishes, and examples of craftsmanship should be retained and preserved. Owners are encouraged to reproduce missing historic elements that were original to the building, but have been removed.*

Physical or photographic evidence should be used to substantiate the reproduction of missing features.

5. Deteriorated or damaged historic features and elements should be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration or existence of structural or material defects requires replacement, the feature or element should match the original in design, dimension, texture, material, and finish. The applicant must demonstrate the severity of deterioration or existence of defects by showing that the historic materials are no longer safe and/or serviceable and cannot be repaired to a safe and/or serviceable condition.

6. Features that do not contribute to the significance of the site or building and exist prior to the adoption of these guidelines, such as incompatible windows, aluminum soffits, or iron porch supports or railings, may be maintained; however, if it is proposed they be changed, those features must be brought into compliance with these guidelines.

7. Each site should be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Owners are discouraged from introducing architectural elements or details that visually modify or alter the original building design when no evidence of such elements or details exists.

8. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, should be undertaken using recognized preservation methods. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials should not be used. Treatments that sustain and protect, but do not alter appearance, are encouraged.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction should not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the site or building.

10. New additions and related new construction should be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment could be restored.

These Universal Design Guidelines are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Staff finds that overall these Universal Guidelines provide sufficient direction. Staff would recommend clarifying Universal Guideline #4 by adding language clarifying that owners may reproduce missing historic elements consistent with those seen on properties of similar design, age, and detailing. Staff also recommends that Universal Design Guideline #9 be amended to further reflect the Secretary of the Interior's Standards by clarifying that new additions should be differentiated from the historic structure but also compatible. These changes are outlined below:

4. Distinctive materials, components, finishes, and examples of craftsmanship should be retained and preserved. Owners are encouraged to reproduce missing historic elements that were original to the building, but have been removed. Physical or photographic evidence should be used to substantiate the reproduction of missing features. It may be appropriate to reproduce missing

historic elements that are consistent with properties of similar design, age, and detailing in some cases.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction should not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the site or building. The new work should be differentiated from the historic structure or construction and should be compatible with the historic structure or construction in materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

2. Site Design

Currently, Specific Design Guidelines A. Site Design (pages 29-30 of the Design Guidelines) provides direction on Building Setbacks & Orientation, Stone Retaining Walls, Fences and Handrails, Steps, Landscaping & Site Grading. Based on the outline for the revised Design Guidelines (Exhibit A), staff has made several recommendations for reorganizing the Design Guidelines, introducing new subsections such as Topography and Grading; and Gazebos, Pergolas, and Other Shade Structures. Further, staff has added additional guidelines for Landscaping and moved Parking Areas to the Site Design Subsection.

Staff's proposed changes are outlined below in red:

A.1. BUILDING SETBACKS & ORIENTATION

A.1.1 Maintain the existing front and side yard setbacks of Historic Sites.

A.1.2 Preserve the original location of the main entry, if extant.

~~A.1.3 Maintain the original path or steps leading to the main entry, if extant.~~

A.2. TOPOGRAPHY AND GRADING

~~A.5.8~~ 2.1. Maintain the original grading of the site when and where feasible.

~~A.5.3~~ 2.2. The historic character of the site should not be significantly altered by substantially changing the proportion of built or paved area to open space or vice versa. In

A.53 LANDSCAPING & SITE GRADING VEGETATION

~~A.53.1~~ Respect and maintain historic landscape features that contribute to the character of the site and those that provide sustainability benefits.

~~A.3.2~~ Maintain established native plantings on site. Protect established vegetation during construction to avoid damage and replace damaged, aged, or diseased trees as necessary. Vegetation that may encroach upon or damage the historic building may be removed, but should be replaced with similar vegetation away from the historic building.

~~A.5.2~~ Incorporate landscape treatments for driveways, walkways, paths, building and accessory structures in a comprehensive, complimentary and integrated design.

~~A.5.6 A.3.3~~ Provide a detailed landscape plan, particularly for the front yard, that respects the manner and materials used traditionally in the districts. Consider all relationships on and with the site when planning for the long term sustainability of the landscape system. Relationships between site and building as well as between plants with other plants on site should be considered.

A.53.4 Landscape plans should balance water efficient irrigation methods and drought tolerant and native plant materials with existing plant materials and site features that contribute to the significance of the site.

~~A.3.6~~ Use to advantage existing stormwater management features, such as gutters, downspouts, as well as site topography and vegetation that contribute to the sustainability of the historic property.

~~A.3.7~~ Where watering systems are necessary, use those which minimize water loss, such as drip irrigation. Consider use of xeriscaping or permaculture strategies for landscape design to maximize water efficiency; these systems should be designed to maintain the traditional character of the lot as viewed from the public right-of-way.

~~A.5.5~~ Landscape plans should allow for snow storage from driveways.

~~A.5.7~~ Provide landscaped separations between parking areas, drives, service areas, and public use areas including walkways, plazas, and vehicular access points.

A.24 STONE RETAINING WALLS

~~A.2.1~~ Maintain historic stone retaining walls in their original locations. Maintain the line of stone retaining walls along the street. Walls of stone, concrete, or rock-faced concrete block that are original to a property should be preserved and maintained in their original dimensions.

~~A.2.2~~ Maintain the original dimensions of historic retaining walls.

~~A.2.2~~ Walls should be repaired with materials which closely approximate the original. Replace only those portions of historic stone retaining walls that have deteriorated beyond repair. When repair of a deteriorated feature is not feasible, the replacement must reuse the existing stone where possible, or otherwise match the original in color, shape, size, and design.

~~A.2.3~~ To reduce failure of walls, improve drainage behind them so that water drains away from walls. Preserve and repair existing stone and mortar.

~~A.2.4~~ New retaining walls should be consistent with historic features in design, materials, and scale. Simple scored concrete, stone, other historic materials are recommended over concrete block, asphalt, or other modern concrete treatments.

~~A.2.5~~ Walls of brick, concrete, or stone may be reconstructed based on physical or pictorial evidence or added to the front of a property if historically appropriate and consistent with the character of the district.

~~A.2.6~~ Maintain stone in its natural finish. It is not appropriate to paint, stain, or plaster over stone walls.

A.3. FENCES & HANDRAILS

A.3.1 ~~Maintain~~ Historic fences and handrails should be preserved and maintained.

A.3.2 Historic fences ~~and handrails~~ may be reconstructed based on photographic evidence. The reconstruction should match the original in design, color, texture, and material. Wood picket fences with flat, dog-ear, or pointed-tops were typical in the front yard; the heights of these fences was generally less than three feet (3'), the boards were 3-1/2" wide and spacing of 1-3/4" between boards.

A.3.3 New fences and handrails should reflect the building's style and period. New wood and metal fences located in the front yard should feature traditional designs and patterns. Split or horizontal rail, railroad tie, or timber fences may be located in rear yards but should be avoided in front yards visible from the primary public right-of-way. Vinyl or plastic-coated fencing is not appropriate.

A.3.4 Design a new fence to minimize its environmental impacts. New fences should use green materials and take into account site impacts such as shading, natural topography, and drainage.

A.3.5 Wood fences should be painted using colors complementary to the adjacent house.

A.3.6 Drought tolerant shrubs should be considered in place of a fence or wall.

A.3.7 Arbors emphasizing a fence gate or entry shall be subordinate to the associated historic building or structure and shall complement the design of the historic structure and fence in materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

A.4. PATHS, STEPS, HANDRAILS, & RAILINGS (NOT ASSOCIATED WITH PORCHES)

~~A.1.3~~ A.4.1 ~~Maintain~~ The original path or steps leading to the main entry, if extant, should be maintained and preserved.

A.4.4 ~~2~~ ~~Maintain~~ Historic hillside steps that may be an integral part of the landscape should be maintained and preserved.

A.4.3 New hillside steps should be subordinate to the associated historic building or structure and shall complement the historic structure in materials, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment. For larger runs of stairs, consider changes in material to break up the mass of the stairs.

A.4.4 Historic handrails should be maintained and preserved. Historic handrails may be reconstructed based on photographic evidence; the reconstruction should match the original in design, color, texture, and material.

A.4.5 New handrails and railings shall complement the historic structure in materials, size, scale, and proportions, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

A.5. GAZEBOS, PERGOLAS, AND OTHER SHADE STRUCTURES

A.5.1 Gazebos, pergolas, and other shade structures shall be subordinate to the associated historic building or structure and shall complement the design of the historic structure in materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

A.5.2 The installation of gazebos, pergolas, and other shade structures shall be limited to rear or side yards and have limited visibility when viewed from the primary public right-of-way.

A.5.2. Gazebos, pergolas, and other shade structures shall not attach to the associated building or structure, nor damage historic features of the associated or neighboring historic building(s) or structure(s).

C. A.6. PARKING AREAS, ~~DETACHED GARAGES~~, & DRIVEWAYS

~~C.1.2~~ A.6.1 Minimize the visual impacts of on-site parking by incorporating landscape treatments for driveways, walkways, paths, building and accessory structures in a comprehensive, complimentary and integrated design.

~~A.5.7~~ A.6.2 Provide landscaped separations between parking areas, drives, service areas, and public use areas including walkways, plazas, and vehicular access points.

~~C.1.3~~ A.6.3 When locating new off-street parking areas, the existing topography of the building site and significant site features should be minimally impacted.

~~C.1.4~~ A.6.4 Off-street parking areas should be located within the rear yard and beyond the rear wall plane of the primary structure. ~~C.1.2~~ If locating a parking area in the rear yard is not physically possible, the off-street parking area and associated vehicles should be visually buffered from adjacent properties and the primary public right-of-way. Consider providing a driveway along the side yard of the property where feasible.

A.6.5 Consider using textured and pour paving materials other than smooth concrete for driveways in the front yard. Use permeable paving where appropriate on a historic site to manage storm water. Permeable paving may not be appropriate for all driveways and parking areas.

A.6.6 Avoid paving up to the building foundation to reduce heat island effect, building temperature, damage to the foundation, and storm-water runoff.

Recommendation

Staff has committed to routinely reviewing the existing Design Guidelines for Historic Districts and Historic Sites. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) take public comment on the proposed changes to the *Design Guidelines for Park City's Historic Districts and Historically Significant Buildings*; provide specific amendments to be made to the document if necessary; and make a recommendation to City Council. (A final review of the Design Guideline changes will be requested prior to forwarding a recommendation to City Council.)

Exhibits

Exhibit A

Outline of Proposed Restructuring and Modifications of Design Guidelines

Existing Design Guidelines	Proposed Design Guidelines
<p><u>Design Guidelines for Historic Sites</u> Universal Guidelines</p> <p>Specific Guidelines</p> <p>A. Site Design</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A.1. Building Setbacks & Orientation A.2. Stone Retaining Walls A.3. Fences & Handrails A.4. Steps A.5. Landscaping & Site Grading <p>B. Primary Structures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> B.1. Roofs B.2. Exterior Walls B.3. Foundations B.4. Doors B.5. Windows B.6. Mechanical Systems, Utility Systems, and Service Equipment B.7. Paint and Color <p>C. Parking Areas</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> C.1 Off-Street Parking C.2. Driveways C.3. Detached Garages <p>D. Additions to Historic Structures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> D.1. Protection for Historic Structures and Sites D.2. General Compatibility D.3. Scenario 1: Residential Historic Sites—Basement Addition without Garage D.4. Scenario 2: Residential Historic Sites—Basement Addition with Garage <p>E. Relocation and/or Reorientation of Intact Buildings</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> E.1. Protection for the Historic Site <p>F. Disassembly/Reassembly of All or Part of a Historic Structure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> F.1. General Principles 	<p><u>Design Guidelines for Historic Residential Sites</u> Universal Guidelines</p> <p>Specific Guidelines</p> <p>Site Design</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Street Patterns and Streetscape • Building Setback and Orientation • Topography and Grading • Landscaping and Vegetation • Stone Retaining Walls • Fences • Steps and Handrails (Not associated with porch) • Gazebos, Pergolas, and Other Shade Structures • Parking (Areas and Driveways) <p>Primary Structures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Foundation • Exterior Walls • Roofs • Doors • Windows • Porches • Gutters and Downspouts • Chimneys and Stove Pipes • Mechanical Systems <p>Additions to Primary Structures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Protection of Historic Sites and Structures • General Compatibility • Basement Addition With Garage • Basement Addition Without Garage • Decks <p>Historic Accessory Structures</p> <p>Character Zones</p>

- F.2. Documentation Requirements prior to the commencement of Disassembly
- F.3. Disassembly
- F.4. Protection of the Disassembled Components
- F.5. Reassembly

G. Reconstruction of Existing Historic Structures

H. Accessory Structures

I. Signs

J. Exterior Lighting (Building Mounted)

K. Awnings

L. Sustainability

M. Seismic Upgrades

N. ADA Compliance

Supplemental Rehabilitation Guidelines

Main Street National Register Historic District

Design Guidelines for Historic Commercial Sites

Universal Design Guidelines

Specific Design Guidelines

Site Design

- Street Patterns and Streetscape
- Building Setback and Orientation
- Topography and Grading
- Landscaping and Vegetation

Primary Structure

- Foundation
- Exterior Walls
- Roofs
- Store Fronts
- Doors (not included in Storefronts)
- Windows (not included in Storefronts)
- Balconies/Porticos
- Awnings
- Chimney and Stovepipes
- Mechanical Equipment

Additions to Primary Structures

- Protection of Historic Sites and Structures
- General Compatibility
- Basement Additions
- Balconies/Decks

Historic Accessory Structures

****Staff has chosen not to re-number the revised Guidelines in order to allow greater flexibility when reorganizing the revised guidelines in the future.****

Design Guidelines for New Construction in Historic Districts

**Universal Design Guidelines
Specific Design Guidelines**

A. Site Design

- A.1. Building Setbacks & Orientation
- A.2. Lot Coverage
- A.3. Fences
- A.4. Site Grading & Steep Slope Issues
- A.5. Landscaping

B. Primary Structures

- B.1. Mass, Scale, & Height
- B.2. Key Building Elements
 - Foundations
 - Roofs
 - Materials
 - Windows and Doors
 - Porches
 - Paint and Color
 - Mechanical and Utility Systems and Service Equipment

C. Reconstruction of Non-Surviving Structures

D. Off-Street Parking Areas, Garages, & Driveways

- D.1. Off-Street Parking Areas**
- D.2. Garages**
- D.3. Driveways**

E. Signs

F. Awnings

G. Exterior Lighting

H. Accessory Structures

I. Sustainability

J. Mailboxes, Utility Boxes, and other Visual Elements in the Landscape

Supplemental Guidelines

Swede Alley

Main Street National Register Historic District

Design Guidelines for Infill Residential Development

Universal Guidelines

Specific Guidelines

Site Design

- Street Patterns and Streetscape
- Sameness
- Building Setback and Orientation
- Topography and Grading
- Landscaping and Vegetation
- Stone Retaining Walls
- Fences
- Steps and Handrails (Not associated with porch)
- Gazebos, Pergolas, and Other Shading Structures
- Parking (Areas and Driveways)

Primary Structures

- Foundation
- Exterior Walls
- Roofs
- Doors
- Windows
- Porches
- Gutters and Downspouts
- Chimneys and Stove Pipes
- Mechanical Systems
- Decks
- Materials

New Accessory Structures

Design Guidelines for Infill Commercial Development

Universal Design Guidelines

Specific Design Guidelines

Site Design

- Street Patterns and Streetscape
- Building Setback and Orientation
- Topography and Grading
- Landscaping and Vegetation

Primary Structure

- Foundation
- Exterior Walls
- Roofs
- Store Fronts for Main Street
- Doors (not included in Storefronts)
- Windows(not included in Storefronts)
- Balconies/Decks
- Awnings
- Chimney and Stovepipes
- Mechanical Equipment
- Materials

New Accessory Structures

Treatment of Historic Building Materials

- Wood
- Masonry
- Architectural Metals
- Exterior Paint & Color

Relocation, Panelization, and Reconstruction of Historic Buildings

Sustainability in Historic Buildings

Seismic Upgrades in Historic Buildings

ADA Compliance

Exterior Lighting

Signs

Mailboxes & Other Visual Elements in the Landscape